

Budget Proposals 2013/14: Major Decision: Business Unit: Resident & Visitor Services – Beach Services

Combined Impact Assessment: Full assessment (Part 2)

The council and its partners are facing a significant challenge in the savings it needs to make over the next couple of years. This Full Impact Assessment has been developed as a tool to enable business units to fully consider the impact of proposed major decisions on the community. As a council we need to ensure that we are able to deliver the savings that we need to make from the 1st April and be able to justify our decisions through any legal challenge.

This full assessment, combined with the initial review, will evidence that you have fully considered the impact of your proposed changes and carried out appropriate consultation on those changes with the key stakeholders. The Combined Impact Assessment will allow Councillors to make informed decisions as part of the decision-making process regarding the council's budget.

Name: Sue Cheriton

Position: Executive Head – Resident and Visitor Services

Business Unit: Residents & Visitor Services

Department: Resort Services

Date Commenced: December 2012

Date: January 2013

Summary from Overall Proposal

Proposals – Outline	Savings 2013/14		Implementation Cost Include brief outline + year incurred	Delivery In place 01/04/13 If earlier or later state date	Risks / impact of proposals <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Potential risks Impact on community Knock on impact to other agencies 	Type of decision*		
	Income £ 000's	Budget reduction £ 000's				Internal	Minor	Major
Beach Services	30	142	TBC	1/4/13	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Potential that we are no longer compliant with Blue Flag scheme. 		x	

Section 1: Purpose of the proposal/strategy/decision

No	Question	Details
1.	Clearly set out the purpose of the proposal	<p>Budget Savings Breakdown</p> <p>Beach Services</p> <p>112,000 Reducing staffing on beaches (Less Agency Staff Required) – recommended that the revised service is as follows: 3 x Mobile teams April to end of September Fully staffed beach service on managed beaches from 1st July to 1st September for 2013 – this may vary year on year to fall into main school holiday times. Automated key boxes provided for short let beach hut users outside the new staffed season.</p> <p>18,000 Reduced maintenance and vandalism (Contractors) 2,000 Reduced marketing/printing</p> <p>10,000 Reduced maintenance (Property/Cliff) – this would mean that only</p>

No	Question	Details
		<p>emergency health and safety works would take place. Any large scale issues would have to dealt with through the capital programme</p> <p>20,000 Additional income (Beach Hut lettings) – new sites and provision identified</p> <p>10,000 Additional income (Beach Hut Winter Storage) – relating to additional sites offered to the public</p> <p><u>172,000</u></p> <p>Due to the Blue Flag requirement to have a permanent staff presence on the beaches to deal with First Aid, Lost Children and other functions from 1st May to 30th September, these proposals mean that there may not be eligibility on any of Torbay's beaches. Torbay is in discussion with ENCAM's to see if the award status criteria can be adjusted to accommodate the new staffing schedules. This is to be considered in February.</p>
2.	Who is intended to benefit / who will be affected?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Visitors to beaches in Torbay • Beach Hut users • Beach Concession owners
3.	What is the intended outcome?	<p>The outcome of the proposal is to reduce the resort services budget by reducing the staffing of the beaches with a mobile service for May and June and September with full staffing complement only for the period 1st July to 1st September (currently the beaches are fully staffed from May through to end September).</p>

Section 2: Equalities, Consultation and Engagement

Torbay Council has a moral obligation as well as a duty under the Equality Act 2010 to eliminate discrimination, promote good relations and advance equality of opportunity between people who share a protected characteristic and people who do not.

The **Equalities, Consultation and Engagement** section ensures that, as a council, we take into account the Public Sector Equality Duty at an early stage and provide evidence to ensure that we fully consider the impact of our decisions/proposals on the Torbay community.

Evidence, Consultation and Engagement

No	Question	Details
4.	<p>Have you considered the available evidence?</p>	<p>This service supports 22 beaches and Coves. The season currently starts in May and closes in September, during which time 9 of these beaches are staffed. The proposal is to reduce the staffing on the beaches to between 1st July and 1st September with a mobile attendant service for the May June and September months (i.e. no beach static attendants for May/June and September).</p> <p>Currently the beach staff are responsible for the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Over 1000 beach huts provided on seasonal and short lets basis, the staff assist in the maintenance of beach huts, storage over the winter and take bookings. • Putting out and taking payment for deck chairs. • Beach safety supervision including, first aid services, lost children, beach safety inspections and storm response • Monitoring sea conditions with the provision of the safety flags to advise swimmers of conditions throughout the day, and measuring water quality and displaying this for public information purposes • Enforcement of the dog bans and use of hazardous equipment like inflatables <p>Staffed Summer Sites breakdown:</p> <p>Oddicombe (and Beach Huts) Meadfoot - (Staff will look after southern end (Kilmorie) and Beach Huts Abbey Sands - (Staff also look after Beacon Cove, Princess Gardens, Princess Pier, Livermead and Institute Beaches, Watcombe Beach) Corbyn Head</p>

No	Question	Details																												
		<p>Preston - (Staff look after Hollicombe Beach and Beach Huts) Paignton - (Staff look after Fairy Cove and provide first aid assistance for the new Paignton Play Park) Goodrington - (Staff look after Goodrington North, Roundham Head, Fishcombe Cove and Beach Huts) Broadsands - (Staff look after Elberry Cove and Beach Huts) Breakwater – (and Beach Huts) Shoalstone Pool (and Beach Huts) – note this service is being reviewed following the budget being withdrawn in 2011/12 and a temporary arrangement put in place. This is still under discussion for the summer season in 2013.</p> <p>Last year staff dealt with 2,290 incidences, a breakdown of these are as follows:</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="573 539 1187 1326"> <thead> <tr> <th data-bbox="573 539 1037 659">INCIDENT REPORT (taken from years 2011)</th> <th data-bbox="1037 539 1187 659">TOTAL</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td data-bbox="573 659 1037 703">MINOR FIRST AID CASUALTY</td> <td data-bbox="1037 659 1187 703">1272</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="573 703 1037 783">MAJOR FIRST AID CASUALTY</td> <td data-bbox="1037 703 1187 783">366</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="573 783 1037 828">AMBULANCE CALLED</td> <td data-bbox="1037 783 1187 828">12</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="573 828 1037 873">LOST CHILDREN</td> <td data-bbox="1037 828 1187 873">12</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="573 873 1037 917">DOGS ON BEACH</td> <td data-bbox="1037 873 1187 917">44</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="573 917 1037 997">POLICE ASSISTANCE REQUIRED</td> <td data-bbox="1037 917 1187 997">14</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="573 997 1037 1077">VERBAL/THREATENING BEHAVIOUR</td> <td data-bbox="1037 997 1187 1077">9</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="573 1077 1037 1121">RED FLAG RAISED</td> <td data-bbox="1037 1077 1187 1121">48</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="573 1121 1037 1166">OFF-SHORE WIND SIGNS</td> <td data-bbox="1037 1121 1187 1166">417</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="573 1166 1037 1211">OSCAR 4 CALLED</td> <td data-bbox="1037 1166 1187 1211">35</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="573 1211 1037 1256">COAST GUARD CALLED</td> <td data-bbox="1037 1211 1187 1256">8</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="573 1256 1037 1300">RESCUE ASSISTANCE GIVEN</td> <td data-bbox="1037 1256 1187 1300">2</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="573 1300 1037 1326">RESCUE EQUIPMENT USED</td> <td data-bbox="1037 1300 1187 1326">0</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	INCIDENT REPORT (taken from years 2011)	TOTAL	MINOR FIRST AID CASUALTY	1272	MAJOR FIRST AID CASUALTY	366	AMBULANCE CALLED	12	LOST CHILDREN	12	DOGS ON BEACH	44	POLICE ASSISTANCE REQUIRED	14	VERBAL/THREATENING BEHAVIOUR	9	RED FLAG RAISED	48	OFF-SHORE WIND SIGNS	417	OSCAR 4 CALLED	35	COAST GUARD CALLED	8	RESCUE ASSISTANCE GIVEN	2	RESCUE EQUIPMENT USED	0
INCIDENT REPORT (taken from years 2011)	TOTAL																													
MINOR FIRST AID CASUALTY	1272																													
MAJOR FIRST AID CASUALTY	366																													
AMBULANCE CALLED	12																													
LOST CHILDREN	12																													
DOGS ON BEACH	44																													
POLICE ASSISTANCE REQUIRED	14																													
VERBAL/THREATENING BEHAVIOUR	9																													
RED FLAG RAISED	48																													
OFF-SHORE WIND SIGNS	417																													
OSCAR 4 CALLED	35																													
COAST GUARD CALLED	8																													
RESCUE ASSISTANCE GIVEN	2																													
RESCUE EQUIPMENT USED	0																													

No	Question	Details	
		ACCIDENTS	4
		CRIMINAL DAMAGE	21
		OTHER INCIDENTS	26
		TOTAL	2290
		<p>It should be noted that for 2012 with the poor weather the use of the beaches were lower than normal. The attached spreadsheet shows for comparison.</p> <p>It should be noted that Beacon Cove & Fishcombe beaches are not staffed at all throughout the year and the winter service remains the same.</p> <p>There is the potential that as a result of the change in staffing that Torbay may lose its blue flag status – Torbay currently holds blue flags on the following beaches; – Oddicombe (the only beach who has never lost it's Blue Flag status since the award first began), Meadfoot Beach, Paignton Sands (which did lose it status part way through the season due to water quality issues), Broadsands, Breakwater/Shoalstone Beach</p> <p>Currently Torbay has 27 Beach concession lessees across all of the beaches</p> <p>It is difficult to directly compare the winter and summer season both having completely different demands and requirements, bringing different responses and liabilities. There is an immense difference in the number of visitors from summer to winter and in their expectations and how we fulfil their needs. The actions we carry out over the winter are not as a result of the beaches not being manned.</p> <p>Summer Season Customer Promise as published on Torbay Council's Website is printed below:</p> <p>All main beaches will be supervised 09.00 – 17.00 seven days a week. Services provided will be at a level to satisfy current Beach Award criteria.</p> <p>All main beaches will be checked and litter picked by hand daily, a rota of mechanical cleaning will begin in May. Seaweed will be removed from the main beaches during the mechanical clean, although the rota may be disrupted after extreme sea conditions. It may not be possible to remove all of the sea weed in one session. The rota will change to suit tides and local conditions.</p> <p>All litterbins will be emptied at least once per day and more frequently as needs require and staffing allows.</p>	

No	Question	Details
		<p>Promenades will be litter picked daily each morning and swept as needed. Essential maintenance will be done as soon as practicable on a priority basis. Non-essential maintenance will be carried out within budget constraints. Beach huts and chalets will be maintained to a standard that ensures basic security and weatherproofing. (Not cosmetic) A recorded check of all lifebuoys will be made twice a week.</p> <p>The minor beaches not permanently staffed throughout the season will receive at least two visits per week during the summer period.</p> <p>During the winter the Out of Season - Beach Service Customer Promise as published on Torbay Councils website is printed below:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All main beaches will be visually checked at least 4 times per week, for health and safety and any signs of pollution or damage. • Litter will be removed from main beaches and nearby walkways by hand at least twice a week and beach litterbins emptied twice per week. • Larger items such as tree trunks and maritime debris may remain on beaches until practicable to remove. • Minor beaches will be checked at least once a week and handpicked of minor litter once a week if staff levels allow. • Damage will be repaired when it presents an immediate safety risk to the public; otherwise it may not be done until risk of extreme weather has passed when it will be prioritised. • Seaweed will not be removed from any beach during the winter as this provides a natural sea defence against the scouring out of the beaches by aggressive sea conditions. • The usual procedures will not be possible to maintain after major storms or extreme sea conditions. • No beach will be supervised during the winter season. • A recorded check of all lifebuoys will be made twice a week on main beaches and once a week on minor beaches. <p>When complying with this standard at current staffing levels it is possible to spend just 15 minutes at any location, should circumstances require more than this then that time is lost from other sites.</p> <p>With the proposed savings the Council will not be able to meet the current summer customer promise and the early and late season could also be adversely affected as there may be many other extra demands on the time of the remaining</p>

No	Question	Details
		<p>staff.</p> <p>The reductions proposed in maintenance and cliff works will impact the amount of reactive maintenance that can be achieved. In this instance only Health and Safety works will be undertaken for 2013/14 to meet these saving targets.</p> <p>The increase in beach hut income will be a result of increasing the number and standard of beach huts available to customers on selected beaches. The reduction in maintenance could affect the rental income of the existing beach hut stock, with customers being unhappy with the offer.</p> <p>The Blue Flag criteria require the beaches to be staffed at core times each day between 1st May and 30th September. Therefore to reduce staffing to the proposed levels on the beaches would mean that Torbay may no longer be able to apply or receive the Blue Flag Award for any of its beaches.</p>
5.	How have you consulted on the proposal?	<p>This proposal was considered as part of the Priorities & Resources review panel meeting taking place on the 16th January 2013, in which members considered this proposal and members of the public were able to attend.</p> <p>This issue has been included as part of the corporate budget consultation.</p> <p>English Riviera Tourism Company (ERTC) have been consulted and have raised concerns as their current published guide specifies the beaches that have award status in their print – however it should be noted that the booklet does state that “the information is correct at the time of printing”. This was raised at an ERTC Board Meeting and concerns were raised with Council Board members at that time.</p>
6.	Outline the key findings	<p><u>Priorities & Resources:</u></p> <p>Representations made at the Priorities & Resources (Overview & Scrutiny) Panel:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Seaside is Torbay’s biggest capital asset” • “Maintenance of beach huts and deckchairs already deplorably low - Income from those will decrease” • “Tourist industry trying to extend the season, council doing the opposite” • “Greatest concern is that the beach service and general appearance will decline” • “Beaches are the shop window of the resort” • “People are holidaying in the colder months of the season (April, May, September, October) – they’ll vote with

No	Question	Details												
		<p><i>their feet if the proms are grubby and they can't get any assistance</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>“Concerned about safety on the beaches”</i> <p>Please Note: The comments of the Overview and Scrutiny Board are set out in paragraphs 4.34-4.37 of its report “Review of Priorities and Resources 2013/2014”</p> <p><u>Torbay Budget Consultation:</u></p> <p>Q6.1) Do you support this proposal?</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="1126 560 1565 735"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>Number</th> <th>Percent</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Yes</td> <td>222</td> <td>75.0%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>No</td> <td>74</td> <td>25.0%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Total</td> <td>296</td> <td>100.0%</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Most respondents (75.0%) supported this proposal.</p> <p>Respondents who said no, they did not support the proposal were asked to say why they didn't support it. Key issues from these responses with examples of comments regarding the proposal are outlined in the Torbay Budget Consultation report.</p> <p>Please see Torbay Budget Consultation Report 2013 – 14 for more information</p>		Number	Percent	Yes	222	75.0%	No	74	25.0%	Total	296	100.0%
	Number	Percent												
Yes	222	75.0%												
No	74	25.0%												
Total	296	100.0%												
7.	What amendments may be required as a result of the consultation?	To be considered following ratification at Full Council												

Positive and Negative Equality Impacts

No	Question	Details		
8.	Identify the potential positive and negative impacts on specific groups			
		Positive Impact	Negative Impact	Neutral Impact
	All groups in society generally		The proposal is to reduce the full time staffing on the beaches. Full time staffing would now be in place from 1 st July to 1st September, with mobile units servicing the beaches in April, May, June and September.	
	Older or younger people		<p>The proposal is to reduce the full time staffing on the beaches. Full time staffing would now be in place from 1st July to 1st September, with mobile units servicing the beaches in April, May, June and September.</p> <p>There were 12 lost children reported on the beaches in total in 2011. The full time staffing will be in place for the school summer holiday.</p>	
	People with caring responsibilities			There is no differential impact on this group
	People with a disability	A number of our beaches currently provide access for disabled people i.e. pre-existing slopes/ramps – Assisted access facilities are also currently provided at Abbey Sands, Broadsands, Goodrington, Paignton.	. The proposal is to reduce the full time staffing on the beaches. Full time staffing would now be in place from 1 st July to 1st September, with mobile units servicing the beaches in April, May, June and September.	

No	Question	Details	
			The beach service provides specially adapted beach wheelchairs and boardwalks for disabled users to access the beach and the shoreline. These would not be available when the staff are not on duty.
	Women or men		There is no differential impact on this group
	People who are black or from a minority ethnic background (BME)		There is no differential impact on this group
	Religion or belief (including lack of belief)		There is no differential impact on this group
	People who are lesbian, gay or bisexual		There is no differential impact on this group
	People who are transgendered		There is no differential impact on this group
	People who are in a marriage or civil partnership		There is no differential impact on this group
	Women who are pregnant / on maternity leave		There is no differential impact on this group
	Socio-economic (including child poverty)		There is no differential impact.
9.	Is there scope for your proposal to	In addition to the normal un-staffed period October – May, as a result of the proposal beaches will not be staffed from May to July and from the beginning of September – this will mean that there will be no beach attendants on the beaches during this	

No	Question	Details
	eliminate discrimination, promote equality of opportunity and/or foster good relations?	<p>time. It should also be noted that 13 of the 22 beaches and coves do not have a permanent staff presence at any point in the year.</p> <p>A number of our beaches currently provide access for disabled people i.e. pre-existing slopes/ramps</p>

Section 3: Steps required to manage the potential impacts identified

No	Action	Details
10.	Summarise any positive impacts and how they will be realised most effectively?	A number of our beaches currently provide access for disabled people i.e. pre-existing slopes/ramps
11.	Summarise any negative impacts and how these will be managed?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Beach flags will not be put up during this time – although flags are not currently up from October through to May • Public information regarding water quality will not be supplied daily as currently provided– although permanent signage can be put in place to mitigate this but information will be very general and not day specific which is currently based on testing and rainfall levels • Staff will not be on site to provide information, deal with incidents, enforce dog bans on designated beaches, first aid, supply beach furniture, support to lost children, minor beach maintenance – however this is not currently carried out from October through to May • Beach cleaning will not be carried out daily during this time – however TOR2 currently provide a beach cleaning service and the removal of seaweed between May and September, with the exception of Oddicombe, Meadfoot and Breakwater which are cleaned by beach staff. The proposed mobile service would visit these beaches daily in May/June and September. • There is the potential that as a result of the change in the staffing of the beaches that Torbay may lose its Blue Flag status on all beaches – Torbay currently holds blue flags on the following beaches:- Oddicombe (the only beach who has never lost it's Blue Flag status since the award first began), Meadfoot Beach, Paignton Sands (which did lose it status part way through the season due to water quality issues), Broadsands, Breakwater/Shoalstone Beach • Beach concession owners may notice a reduction in the number of people visiting/using their services – this will need to be monitored.

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Staff will not be as available as they currently are to provide specially adapted beach wheelchairs and boardwalks for disabled users to access the beach and the shoreline. There are however a number of beaches which have permanent slopes to allow access for disabled people.
--	--	---

Section 4: Recommended course of action

No	Action	Details
12.	<p>State a recommended course of action</p> <p>[please refer to action plan]</p>	<p>Outcome 3: Continue with proposal - Despite having identified some <i>potential</i> for adverse impact / missed opportunities in relation to equalities or to promote equality. Full justification required, especially in relation to equalities, in line with the duty to have 'due regard'.</p> <p>It is recommended that this proposal is implemented.</p>

Section 5: Monitoring and Action Plan

No	Action	Details
13.	<p>Outline plans to monitor the actual impact of your proposals</p>	<p>Beach user & beach hut user surveys are currently undertaken annually – The Council will also monitor the rates of accidents reported, complaints received etc.</p> <p>Beach concession owners will be asked to advise if they see a decline in the number of visitors/users of their services</p>

Action plan

No.	Action	Reason for action / contingency	Resources	Responsibility	Deadline date
1	Annual survey – Beach Hut User/ Beach User/ Beach Concession	To monitor the ongoing impact of the proposal		Beach Manager	Annually